



Job Evaluation Committee Report to Local 2010 Members

Membership meeting July 23, 2014





Updates in this presentation:

- See our previous presentation (Feb. 25, 2014) - <http://usw2010.ca/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Job-Evaluation-Presentation-February-25-2014.pdf> for:
 - what is a Job Evaluation?
 - required factors, optional subfactors for Pay-Equity compliant Job Evaluation system
 - Why does Job Evaluation matter to you?
 - Grade Distribution by Gender in Local 2010
 - Earnings of Males vs Females, Ontario, 1975 – 2011 (F/M about 75% in 2011!)
 - 17 Factors used in U of T SES/U Job Evaluation Tool
 - **Equal Pay Day: April 16, 2014**

**WE NEED QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY TO BE IN COMPLIANCE WITH
ONTARIO'S EQUAL PAY LEGISLATION!!**



Updates in this presentation:

- Updates today:
 - Overview of Pay Equity Act, requirements of employers
 - Reminder of LOU in Local 2010 Collective Agreement, 2012
 - Recent developments:
 - joint JEC meetings,
 - other USW locals,
 - Local 2010 data
 - Position Gender Dominance – definition, situation in Local 2010
 - Female-Dominated Positions, Male-Dominated Positions, Gender-neutral positions
 - Jobs in Local 2010 with same title, different grade

**WE NEED QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY TO BE IN COMPLIANCE WITH
ONTARIO'S EQUAL PAY LEGISLATION!!**



Overview of Pay Equity Act (1987, 1993)

- Pay equity is “equal pay for work of equal value”
- **Pay equity is a fundamental human right** - UN, ILO, Ont & Can & other governments - see <http://www.payequity.gov.on.ca/en/index.php>
- Purpose of act: to redress systemic gender discrimination in compensation for work performed by employees in female job classes
- Act requires employers to identify and correct gender discrimination that may be present in pay practices and to adjust wages of employees in female job classes to be at least equal to wages of employees in male job classes comparable in value based on **skill, effort, responsibility & working conditions**
- **All employers must maintain pay equity; must prepare and post pay equity plans; negotiate all aspects of pay equity with unions; spend a minimum of 1% of previous yr's payroll for pay equity adjustments until pay equity is achieved**



Reminder of LOU in 2012 Collective Agreement:

1. The Parties agree to establish a joint Job Evaluation Committee (JEC) to investigate, evaluate and make recommendations concerning a mutually acceptable gender neutral job evaluation system and methodology for bargaining unit positions that is compliant with the Ontario Pay Equity Act.
2. The goal of this process is the development of a gender neutral, points factor job evaluation system that measures the following four job factors outlined in the Pay Equity Act:
 - Skill •Effort •Responsibility •Working conditions
3. The Committee will consider elements such as:
 - The gender neutrality of the system and the process
 - The accurate collection of job information (e.g. questionnaires, position descriptions) and obtaining information about positions (e.g. audits, interviews)
 - The number and description of the levels within the factors
 - The weighting of the factors
 - The sign-off requirements
 - Job evaluation process, including possible use of one or more job evaluation rating committees
 - Automated features of a system
 - Roles of the various stakeholders: incumbents, Managers, Human Resources, the Union



Recent Developments – Joint JEC meetings:

- We have met as Joint JEC Committee 4 times (Dec. 16, Feb. 18, Mar. 20, April 3, 2014)
- Have drawn up a schedule of 12 meetings, to take us through to posting a RFP for a JE system (was scheduled For June 24)
- Our last meeting: introduction to RFP process (April 3)
- After this employer has cancelled 7 meetings; Procurement has not provided RFP examples
- Employer says there is a conflict of interest – “Procurement has raised concern about a conflict under procurement legislation”. We believe it has to do with USW members being on a committee that will consider a USW JE system – shows no urgency or intention to resolve the issue – “We will advise you of the outcome of our discussion with Procurement as soon as practicable”



Recent Developments – other USW locals:

- Local 2010 JEC has meet as a committee with JEC members from USW Local 1998 (U of T) and Local 4120 (Guelph)
- They were VERY helpful and forthcoming in sharing info, resources, advice
- Some takeaways:
 - Best systems **transparent JE systems, clearly consistent with Pay Equity legislation**, also 3rd party hosting of JE data, with joint access
 - JE involves **massive outreach to members**, member involvement on **several concurrent JE committees** (Guelph has 3 concurrent committees, U of T interviewed 5000 members over several years);
 - Commitment/agreement to **periodic JE of every position** in Local (Guelph has 5 yr evaluations)



Recent Developments – Local 2010 data:

- Articles 4.03 and 4.11 provide for information to be provided to Local 2010 about members
- Article 4.03 – monthly membership dues payments
- Article 4.11 – quarterly membership lists with member information:
 - From PS HR: position title, home address, Queen's email, pay rate and gender
 - From Payroll: departmental address (where pay stub is sent)
- HR has been helpful clarifying data meaning and sources to help us interpret the data correctly



Local 2010 Position Information, April 30, 2014

- Last Pay Equity Plan Queen's has given us was dated 1991
- Queen's has given us job grade, gender info about our members – and has clarified some data interpretation
- We can classify all positions by gender dominance:
 - Male-dominated (70% or more held by males)
 - Female-dominated (60% or more held by females)
 - Gender-neutral (neither of above)

Source:

http://www.payequity.gov.on.ca/en/resources/elearn/transcripts/pe4_jobclasses.php



Position Gender Dominance in Local 2010

- 837 (75%) of positions in our local are Female-Dominated
- 203 (18%) are Male dominated, 69 (6%) are gender-neutral
- 823 (96%) of Females work in Female-dominated positions
- 199 (80%) of Males work in Male-dominated positions

Count of position	posn gender dominance			Grand Total	% of total
	F	M	neutral		
Sex					
F	823	4	32	859	77%
M	14	199	37	250	23%
Total positions	837	203	69	1109	100%
% of F	96%	0%	4%	100%	
% of M	6%	80%	15%	100%	
% of Total Positions	75%	18%	6%	100%	



Position Gender Dominance in Local 2010 – Top Female-Dominated Positions

4. Top Female-dominated positions

Top 20 of 475 shown (6 or more total positions)

	Position Title	F	M	Grand Total	dominance	F/tot ratio	M/tot ratio
1	Administrative Assistant	55		55	F	100%	0%
2	Senior Secretary	24	1	25	F	96%	4%
3	Administrative Secretary	20		20	F	100%	0%
4	Financial Assistant	18	1	19	F	95%	5%
5	Program Assistant	17		17	F	94%	0%
6	Office Assistant	16		16	F	100%	0%
7	Program Coordinator	13	2	15	F	87%	13%
8	Departmental Assistant	12		12	F	100%	0%
9	Undergraduate Program Assistant	12		12	F	100%	0%
10	Clinic Clerk	11		11	F	100%	0%
11	Graduate Assistant	10	1	11	F	91%	9%
12	Graduate Program Assistant	9		9	F	100%	0%
13	Admissions Assistant	8		8	F	100%	0%
14	Admission Coordinator	5	1	6	F	83%	17%
15	Contact Centre Representative	6		6	F	100%	0%
16	Events Coordinator	5	1	6	F	83%	17%
17	Graduate Studies Assistant	6		6	F	100%	0%
18	Personal Counsellor	6		6	F	100%	0%
19	Student Resource Assistant	5	1	6	F	83%	17%
20	Undergraduate Assistant	6		6	F	100%	0%
							11
	Total Female-Dominated positions	823	14	837			



Position Gender Dominance in Local 2010 – Top Male-Dominated Positions

5. Top Male-dominated positions

Top 22 of 160 shown (at least 2 positions)

	Position Title	F	M	Grand Total	dominance	F/tot ratio	M/tot ratio
1	Systems Analyst	1	6	7	M	14%	86%
2	Web Developer	1	5	6	M	17%	83%
3	Senior Systems Analyst	1	4	5	M	20%	80%
4	Stationary Engineer 2		5	5	M	0%	100%
5	Analyst L1 - ITSC	1	3	4	M	25%	75%
6	Maintenance Worker		4	4	M	0%	100%
7	Systems Specialist		3	3	M	0%	100%
8	Web/Application Developer		3	3	M	0%	100%
9	Buyer		2	2	M	0%	100%
10	Classroom Technology and Media Coordinator		2	2	M	0%	100%
11	Educational Technology Analyst		2	2	M	0%	100%
12	Financial Reporting Officer		2	2	M	0%	100%
13	Helpdesk Assistant		2	2	M	0%	100%
14	Information Technology Specialist		2	2	M	0%	100%
15	Microcomputer Specialist		2	2	M	0%	100%
16	Network Specialist		2	2	M	0%	100%
17	Postal Clerk		2	2	M	0%	100%
18	Postal Services Driver/Delivery Clerk		2	2	M	0%	100%
19	Senior Business Analyst		2	2	M	0%	100%
20	Support Analyst 3		2	2	M	0%	100%
21	Technical Specialist		2	2	M	0%	100%
22	Videoconferencing Systems Specialist		2	2	M	0%	100%
	Total Male-Dominated positions	4	199	203			



Position Gender Dominance in Local 2010 – Gender-Neutral Positions

6. Gender-Neutral positions, all shown		20 positions					
	Position Title	F	M	Grand Total	dominance	F/tot ratio	M/tot ratio
1	Program Associate	4	3	7	neutral	57%	43%
2	Career Coach	2	4	6	neutral	33%	67%
3	Financial Analyst	2	3	5	neutral	40%	60%
4	Programmer Analyst	3	2	5	neutral	60%	40%
5	Residence Life Coordinator	3	2	5	neutral	60%	40%
6	Senior Analyst	2	3	5	neutral	40%	60%
7	Application Advisor	2	2	4	neutral	50%	50%
8	Business Analyst	2	2	4	neutral	50%	50%
9	Info Sys Analyst & Consultants	1	2	3	neutral	33%	67%
10	Investment Associate	1	2	3	neutral	33%	67%
11	Superintendent	1	2	3	neutral	33%	67%
12	Systems Coordinator	1	2	3	neutral	33%	67%
13	Application Security Analyst	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
14	Art Technician	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
15	Editor	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
16	Graphic Designer	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
17	Planner	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
18	Senior Admission Coordinator	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
19	Support Analyst 1	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
20	Technical Analyst	1	1	2	neutral	50%	50%
							13
	Total Gender-neutral positions	32	37	69			



Local
 2010,
 positions
 with
 multiple
 grades for
 same
 position

6a. Positions with same Job Title, multiple grades - April 30, 2014															
281 people in 34 job titles, have more than one grade for same job title										34 of 664 job titles shown					
exact same number as in October 31, 2013 list					2 new positions on this list: Residency Program Assistant, Student Support Assistant										
					2 positions on prev list, not on current list: Receptionist, Web/Application Developer										
	Position	002	003	004	005	006	007	008	009	Total	n grades	in prev list	n prev	change	gender dominance
1	Administrative Assistant				1	43	11			55	3	n		new	F
2	Admissions Assistant			1	5	2				8	3	n		new	F
3	Alumni Officer, Branches						1	1		2	2	n		new	F
4	Communications Coordinator						2	1		3	2	n		new	F
5	Departmental Assistant				11	1				12	2	n		new	F
6	Departmental Coordinator					3	2			5	2	n		new	F
7	Educational Assistant			1	3					4	2	n		new	F
8	Events Coordinator				2	3	1			6	3	n		new	F
9	Financial Assistant				18	1				19	2	n		new	F
10	Financial Officer						3		1	4	2	n		new	F
11	Graduate Assistant				8	3				11	2	n		new	F
12	Graduate Program Assistant				4	5				9	2	n		new	F
13	Graduate Studies Assistant				1	5				6	2	n		new	F
14	Graphic Designer					1	1			2	2	n		new	neutral
15	Info Sys Analyst & Consultants						2	1		3	2	n		new	neutral
16	Information Technology Specialist							1	1	2	2	n		new	M
17	Instrumentation Manager						1	1	1	3	3	n		new	F
18	Marketing and Communications Coordinator					1	1			2	2	n		new	F
19	Office Assistant			7	9					16	2	n		new	F
20	Program Administrator					3	2			5	2	n		new	F
21	Program Assistant			2	11	5				18	3	n		new	F
22	Program Coordinator					10	5			15	2	n		new	F
23	Program Manager						2		1	3	2	n		new	F
24	Registration Coordinator					2		1		3	2	n		new	F
25	Residency Program Assistant				2	1				3	2	n		new	F
26	Secretary		1	2						3	2	n		new	F
27	Secretary/Receptionist		2	1						3	2	n		new	F
28	Senior Analyst							4	1	5	2	n		new	neutral
29	Senior Secretary			23	2					25	2	n		new	F
30	Student Support Assistant			1	1					2	2	n		new	F
31	Systems Coordinator						1	2		3	2	n		new	neutral
32	Systems Specialist							2	1	3	2	n		new	M
33	Undergraduate Assistant				4	2				6	2	n		new	F
34	Undergraduate Program Assistant				6	6				12	2	n		new	F
Total Positions with multiple grades		0	3	38	88	97	35	14	6	281					
Total Positions		1	27	149	213	234	239	175	72	1,110					



Local 2010, positions with multiple grades for same position

- 281, or 25% of our members are in positions with multiple grades
- Positions span from grade 3-9 with multiple grades
- Same number as in October 31, 2013 file (281/1096, or 26% then)
- Clearly a violation of Pay Equity legislation – no attempt is being made to compensate people consistently for the same position!

Positions with Multiple Grades - April 30, 2014										
Grade	002	003	004	005	006	007	008	009	Total	%
Total Positions with multiple grades	0	3	38	88	97	35	14	6	281	25%
Total Positions	1	27	149	213	234	239	175	72	1,110	
% of Total Positions	0%	11%	26%	41%	41%	15%	8%	8%	25%	15



Updates in this presentation:

- Follow up from previous presentation, February 25, 2014
- Updates today:
 - Reminder of LOU in Local 2010 Collective Agreement, 2012
 - Overview of Pay Equity Act, requirements of employers
 - Recent developments: joint JEC meetings, other USW locals, Local 2010 data
 - Position Gender Dominance – definition, situation in Local 2010
 - Female-Dominated Positions, Male-Dominated Positions, Gender-neutral positions
 - Jobs in Local 2010 with same title, different grade
- We are going into bargaining –

**WE NEED QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY TO BE IN COMPLIANCE WITH
ONTARIO'S EQUAL PAY LEGISLATION!!**



Local 2010 Job Evaluation Committee members:

- Pam Armitage, Biomedical & Molecular Sciences
- Carol Kavanaugh, Faculty of Arts & Science
- Ken Pearce, Library
- Katherine Rudder, Life Sciences
- Melody Monte, School of Kinesiology and Health
- Lynn Sadlowski, OUR Admissions
- Kelly Orser Smith, USW2010 President
- Peggy McComb, USW2010 Staff Representative
- Andrew MacIsaac, USW National Office, Legal Department



Questions, Comments?